[ICACSIS-2017] Submission Acknowledgement
1 message

ICACSIS Committee <icacsis@cs.ui.ac.id>   Mon, Jul 31, 2017 at 7:09 AM
To: Elly Matul Imah <ellymatul@unesa.ac.id>

Elly Matul Imah:

Thank you for your submission, "Mrs." to ICACSIS 2017. With the online
conference management system that we are using, you will be able to track
its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the conference
web site:

Submission URL:
http://icacsis.cs.ui.ac.id/ocs/index.php/icacsis2017/icacsis2017/author/submission/774
Username: ellymatul

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this
conference as a venue for your work.

ICACSIS Committee
ICACSIS 2017
_____
ICACSIS 2017 International Conference on Advanced Computer Science and
Information Systems
http://icacsis.cs.ui.ac.id/ocs/index.php/icacsis2017/icacsis2017/index

[ICACSIS-2017] Editorial Decision on Paper
3 messages

icacsis <icacsis@cs.ui.ac.id>   Thu, Sep 21, 2017 at 2:20 AM
To: Elly Matul Imah <ellymatul@unesa.ac.id>

Dear Prof/Dr/Mr/Ms/Mrs
Elly Matul Imah:

After a careful review of your submission, "Comparison Study of Machine
Learning Algorithm for Epileptic Seizure Classification on EEG Signals" will
be considered for presentation at ICACSIS 2017 if the following revisions
are successfully implemented.

Thank you and looking forward to your participation in this event.

icacsis
icacsis@cs.ui.ac.id

Reviewer C:

I. Reviewer's Confidence:
    High

II. Quality of The Article1. Originality: How would you rate the originality
of the paper?:
    Adequate

2. Significance of Topic: Is this topic gives significant contribution? :
    Adequate

3. Technical Quality: How would you rate the technical quality of this
paper? :
    Inadequate

4. Presentation: How would you rate the presentation (readibility and
organization) of this paper? :
    Inadequate

5. Literature: Does the paper give complete literature review? :
    Adequate

6. Overall Rating: Do you recommend acceptance or rejection? :
    Decline Submission

III. Comment About the Paper:
    The paper presents a comparative study of various classification and
feature selection algorithms for the problem of epileptic seizure detection
based on EEG signals. The classification algorithms that are evaluated
include Generalized Relevance Learning Vector Quantization (GRLVQ),
Backpropagation, SVM, and Random Forest. The presented accuracy from the
experimental results is 0.98.

While the paper addresses a multidisciplinary problem, it lacks details from
the medical domain that are necessary for improving paper readability. From
the data mining domain, a major issue is that, features for EEG
classification are not explicitly given. English is also a major issue in
the paper, which greatly affects paper readability.

Please find my comments below:

- Page 1: difficult to reliable visual inspection -> is it really true that
manual inspection of EEG data by neurologists is not reliable? I tend to
disagree here. Please provide a reference to back up your claim.

- Page 1: What is the motivation for classifying into the five classes?
Isn't classifying into the two classes sufficient for most cases?

- The related work is explained too broadly. For example, what is the main idea of the new method in [1]?

- GRLVQ is a modification of Relevance Learning Vector Quantization (RLVQ) by using adaptive metric and very powerful to do task in classification. -> If possible, avoid using adjectives (e.g., powerful) in an academic paper as they tend to be not precise.

- The English of the paper can be improved, for example:
   > Comparison Study of Machine Learning Algorithm -> Algorithms
   > Electroencephalography (EEG) is tool -> a tool
Those are just examples, please fix also all other English errors.
   > Classify non-epileptic seizure from healthy subject with opened eyes, or epileptic seizure from epileptic subject easier than non-epileptic seizure with opened eyes in healthy subject, or non-seizure from epileptic subject. -> Not English.
   > some redundancies information -> some redundant information
   > Difference with the other algorithm, GRLVQ rarely use in epileptic seizure identification in EEG signal. -> Compared to the other algorithms, GRLVQ is rarely used in ...
   > GRLVQ is competitive based learning that using prototypes of each classes to classify. -> that uses
   > GRLVQ is proposed by Hammer et all -> et al

- An explanation on the relation between different signals (e.g., Delta, Theta) and the epileptic condition will be appreciated.

- It is unclear to the reviewer what features are really used for the training? What is the relation between segments and features?

Reviewer D:

I. Reviewer's Confidence:
   High

II. Quality of The Article1. Originality: How would you rate the originality of the paper?:
   Adequate

2. Significance of Topic: Is this topic gives significant contribution? :
   Good

3. Technical Quality: How would you rate the technical quality of this paper? :
   Good

4. Presentation: How would you rate the presentation (readibility and organization) of this paper? :
   Adequate

5. Literature: Does the paper give complete literature review? :
   Adequate

6. Overall Rating: Do you recommend acceptance or rejection? :
   Revision Required

III. Comment About the Paper:
   This paper provided a comparison performance of several Machine Learning algorithm on EEG signals classification. Paper has a adequate contribution especially for developing Epileptic classification algorithm. However, paper has a minor originality on methodology.
Paper gave sufficient experiment for a comparative study like accuracy, precision, and CPU computation time. Paper obtain result same as the hypothesis that GRLVQ is most suitable method for this particular problem.
The paper presentation is poor because some figures is low resolution. Paper should use high resolution for figures and equations.

Information Systems
http://icacsis.cs.ui.ac.id/ocs/index.php/icacsis2017/icacsis2017/index

---

Elly Matul Imah . <ellymatul@unesa.ac.id>   Fri, Oct 27, 2017 at 4:57 AM
To: Setya Chendra Wibawa <setyachendra@unesa.ac.id>

[Quoted text hidden]
    Revision
[Quoted text hidden]
--
Best Regards,

Elly Matul Imah
Lecturer and Researcher
Mathematics Department
Universitas Negeri Surabaya
Kampus Unesa Ketintang, Surabaya,
East Java, Indonesia

Elly Matul Imah . <ellymatul@unesa.ac.id>   Tue, Oct 31, 2017 at 10:15 AM
To: Setya Chendra Wibawa <setyachendra@unesa.ac.id>

Best Regards,

Elly Matul Imah
Lecturer and Researcher
Mathematics Department
Universitas Negeri Surabaya
Kampus Unesa Ketintang, Surabaya,
East Java, Indonesia

---------- Forwarded message ----------
From: **icacsis** <icacsis@cs.ui.ac.id>
Date: Thu, Sep 21, 2017 at 2:20 AM
Subject: [ICACSIS-2017] Editorial Decision on Paper
To: Elly Matul Imah <ellymatul@unesa.ac.id>

Dear Prof/Dr/Mr/Ms/Mrs
Elly Matul Imah:

After a careful review of your submission, "Comparison Study of Machine
Learning Algorithm for Epileptic Seizure Classification on EEG Signals" will
be considered for presentation at ICACSIS 2017 if the following revisions
are successfully implemented.

Thank you and looking forward to your participation in this event.

icacsis
icacsis@cs.ui.ac.id

Reviewer C:

I. Reviewer's Confidence:
    High

II. Quality of The Article1. Originality: How would you rate the originality
of the paper?:
    Adequate

2. Significance of Topic: Is this topic gives significant contribution? :
    Adequate

3. Technical Quality: How would you rate the technical quality of this
paper? :
    Inadequate

4. Presentation: How would you rate the presentation (readibility and
organization) of this paper? :

A

Subject: **Acceptance Letter**

Dear Elly,

On behalf of 2017 International Conference on Advanced Computer Science and Information Systems (ICACSIS) Committee, it is our pleasure to confirm that your paper listed below has been invited as speaker in ICACSIS 2017 which will be held at Mercure Hotel Ancol, Jakarta, during October 28-29, 2017.

Accepted paper details:

ID   : 774

Title   : Comparison Study of Machine Learning Algorithm for Epileptic Seizure Classification on EEG Signals

Acceptance of your paper for presentation does not financially oblige the ICACSIS 2017 Committee, nor any of the sponsoring societies, for expenses incurred by you to travel and attend the conference.

Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact us by email to icacsis@cs.ui.ac.id.

Sincerely Yours,

Dr. Eng. Wisnu Jatmiko
General Chair ICACSIS 2017
Faculty of Computer Science
Universitas Indonesia
http://www.icacsis.cs.ui.ac.id